



# THE TENNESSEE BOARD OF JUDICIAL CONDUCT

511 Union Street Suite 600 Nashville, TN 37219

MEMBERS OF THE TENNESSEE BOARD OF JUDICIAL CONDUCT

Chris Craft Chairperson

Timothy R. Discenza Disciplinary Counsel

Patrick J. McHale Assistant Disciplinary Counsel

Jeffrey S. Bivins
Miles Burdine
Angelita B. Dalton
Timothy L. Easter
Joe F. Fowlkes
Tas Gardner
J. Ronald Hickman
Chris A. Hodges
Holly Kirby
Thomas W. Lawless
Christy R. Little
Larry J. Logan
J. Michael Sharp
Dwight E. Stokes

David Wedekind

August 15, 2012

Russell Humphrey Chief Clerk of the Senate Office of the Chief Clerk State Capitol, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor Nashville, TN 37243 Michael W. Catalano, Clerk 100 Supreme Court Building 401 Seventh Avenue, North Nashville, TN 37219-1407 615-253-1470

Joe McCord Chief Clerk of the House Office of the Chief Clerk State Capitol, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor Nashville, TN 37243

#### Dear Chief Clerks:

Please find enclosed the statistical report of the Board of Judicial Conduct covering filings and dispositions for the month of July, 2012, as mandated by Tenn. Code Ann. § 17-5-207. When the Court of Judiciary ceased to exist on July 1, 2012, it had over 40 complaints still pending. These complaints were transferred to the new Board for handling, and are not reflected in the statistics for July, which only refer to newly filed complaints for that month. The new Board could not begin its work until after its first organizational meeting on July 7th, when its officers were elected and Disciplinary Counsel, Assistant Disciplinary Counsel and an investigator were approved and hired by the Board.

If there is a more direct or convenient mailing address to which either of you wish me to send these monthly reports, please advise, and I will use that address next month when the Board makes its report for the month of August, 2012.

Sincerely,

CHRIS CRAFT Board Chair

CC/bep

### BOARD OF JUDICIAL CONDUCT MONTHLY REPORT FOR JULY, 2012

The number and category of complaints OPENED<sup>1</sup> this month:

18
3
2
2
2
1
1
1
1
0
31
•

The number and category of complaints CLOSED this month:

A) Failure to comply with law:	9
B) Bias, prejudice and unfairness:	1
C) Discourtesy:	0
D) Abuse of office:	3
E) Delay:	0
F) Ex parte communications:	1
G) Disability:	1
H) Political violation:	1
I) Recusal:	1
J) Miscellaneous:	_0
TOTAL	17

DISPOSITION of the complaints closed by category this month:

## A) Failure to comply with law:

Dismissed, complaint about court ruling	8
Dismissed, no jurisdiction	0
Dismissed, inadequate factual basis	1
Dismissal with warning	0
Dismissal after full investigation	0
Deferred discipline agreement	0
Private reprimand	0
Private censure	0
Public reprimand	0
Public censure	0

<sup>1.</sup> A single complaint naming several judges is counted as a separate complaint against each judge. A complaint whose allegations encompass more than one category is listed under the most serious category alleged.

Other	- 0
Retired complaint, no longer a judge	- 0
Suspension	
Recommendation of removal from office	0
TOTAL	9
B) Bias, prejudice and unfairness:	
Dismissed, complaint about court ruling	- 1
Dismissed, no jurisdiction	
Dismissed, inadequate factual basis	
Dismissal with warning	
Dismissal after full investigation	
Deferred discipline agreement	
Private reprimand	
Private censure	_
Public reprimand	_
Public censure	
Other	
Retired complaint, no longer a judge	-
Suspension	
Recommendation of removal from office	-
TOTAL	<u>- U</u>
C) Discourtesy:	1
Dismissed, complaint about court ruling	0
Dismissed, no jurisdiction	
Dismissed, inadequate factual basis	
Dismissed, madequate factual basis Dismissal with warning	
Dismissal after full investigation	
Deferred discipline agreement Private reprimand	
Private censure	
Public reprimand	
Public censure	
	- 0
Retired complaint, no longer a judge Suspension	. 0
Recommendation of removal from office	<u>~</u>
TOTAL TOTAL	U
D) Abuse of office:	1
Dismissed, complaint about court ruling	
Dismissed, no jurisdiction	
Dismissed, inadequate factual basis	
Dismissal with warning	
Dismissal after full investigation	
Deferred discipline agreement	0
Private reprimand	0
Private censure	
Public reprimand	0

Public censure	
Other	
Retired complaint, no longer a judge	
Suspension	
Recommendation of removal from office	$\frac{0}{3}$
TOTAL	3
E) Delay: Dismissed, complaint about court ruling	0
Dismissed, no jurisdiction	
Dismissed, inadequate factual basis	0
Dismissal with warning	0
Dismissal after full investigation	
Deferred discipline agreement	
Private reprimand	
Private censure	
Public reprimand	0
Public censure	0
Other	0
Retired complaint, no longer a judge	0
Suspension	0
Recommendation of removal from office	
TOTAL	0
F) Ex parte communications:	^
Dismissed, complaint about court ruling	0
Dismissed, no jurisdiction	
Dismissed, inadequate factual basis Dismissal with warning	
Dismissal after full investigation	
Deferred discipline agreement	
Private reprimand	
Private censure	
Public reprimand	
Public censure	0
Other	0
Retired complaint, no longer a judge	0
Suspension	0
Recommendation of removal from office	<u>0</u>
TOTAL	1
G) Disability:	_
Dismissed, complaint about court ruling	0
Dismissed, no jurisdiction	
Dismissed, inadequate factual basis	I
Dismissal with warning	V
Dismissal after full investigation	
Deferred discipline agreement	0
Private censure	0
are compare	J

Public reprimand 0
Public censure 0
Other 0
Retired complaint, no longer a judge 0
Suspension 0
Recommendation of removal from office 0
TOTAL 1
H) Political violation:
Dismissed, complaint about court ruling 0
Dismissed, no jurisdiction 0
Dismissed, inadequate factual basis 1
Dismissal with warning 0
<del>-</del>
Dismissal after full investigation 0
Deferred discipline agreement 0
Private reprimand 0
Private censure 0
Public reprimand 0
Public censure 0
Other 0
Retired complaint, no longer a judge 0
Suspension 0
Recommendation of removal from office 0
TOTAL 1
I) Recusal:
Dismissed, complaint about court ruling 0
Dismissed, no jurisdiction 0
Dismissed, inadequate factual basis 1
Dismissal with warning 0
Dismissal after full investigation 0
Deferred discipline agreement 0
Private reprimand 0
Private censure 0
Public reprimand 0
Public censure 0
Other 0
Retired complaint, no longer a judge 0
Suspension 0
Recommendation of removal from office0
TOTAL 1
J) Miscellaneous:
Dismissed, complaint about court ruling 0
Dismissed, no jurisdiction 0
Dismissed, inadequate factual basis 0
Dismissal with warning 0
Dismissal after full investigation 0
Deferred discipline agreement 0
Private reprimand 0
4

Private censure	0
Public reprimand	0
Public censure	0
Other	0
Retired complaint, no longer a judge	0
Suspension	0
Recommendation of removal from office	0
TOTAL	0

## **CUMULATIVE YEAR-TO-DATE TOTAL**

Number and nature of complaints OPENED this fiscal year:

A) Failure to comply with law:	18
B) Bias, prejudice and unfairness:	3
C) Discourtesy:	2
D) Abuse of office:	2
E) Delay:	2
F) Ex parte communications:	1
G) Disability:	1
H) Political violation:	1
I) Recusal:	1
J) Miscellaneous:	_0
TOTAL	31

Number and nature of complaints CLOSED this fiscal year:

A) Failure to comply with law:	9
B) Bias, prejudice and unfairness:	1
C) Discourtesy:	0
D) Abuse of office:	3
E) Delay:	0
F) Ex parte communications:	1
G) Disability:	1
H) Political violation:	1
I) Recusal:	1
J) Miscellaneous:	0_
TOTAL	17

DISPOSITION of the complaints closed by category this fiscal year:

## A) Failure to comply with law:

Dismissed, complaint about court ruling	8
Dismissed, no jurisdiction	(
Dismissed, inadequate factual basis	1
Dismissal with warning	(
Dismissal after full investigation	C

Deferred discipline agreement	0
Private reprimand	- 0
Private censure	. 0
Public reprimand	. 0
Public censure	- 0
Other	
Retired complaint, no longer a judge	
Suspension	- 0
Recommendation of removal from office	
TOTAL	_ <del></del> 9
B) Bias, prejudice and unfairness:	
Dismissed, complaint about court ruling	- 1
Dismissed, no jurisdiction	
Dismissed, inadequate factual basis	
Dismissal with warning	. 0
Dismissal after full investigation	0
Deferred discipline agreement	
Private reprimand	. 0
Private censure	0
Public reprimand	0
Public censure	
Other	_
Retired complaint, no longer a judge	- 0
Suspension	. 0
Recommendation of removal from office	
Recommendation of removal from office	0
Recommendation of removal from office TOTAL C) Discourtesy:	1
Recommendation of removal from office TOTAL	0 1 0
Recommendation of removal from office TOTAL  C) Discourtesy: Dismissed, complaint about court ruling Dismissed, no jurisdiction	0 0 0
Recommendation of removal from office TOTAL  C) Discourtesy: Dismissed, complaint about court ruling Dismissed, no jurisdiction Dismissed, inadequate factual basis	0 0 0 0
Recommendation of removal from office TOTAL  C) Discourtesy: Dismissed, complaint about court ruling Dismissed, no jurisdiction Dismissed, inadequate factual basis Dismissal with warning	0 0 0 0 0
Recommendation of removal from office TOTAL  C) Discourtesy: Dismissed, complaint about court ruling Dismissed, no jurisdiction Dismissed, inadequate factual basis Dismissal with warning Dismissal after full investigation	0 0 0 0 0 0
Recommendation of removal from office TOTAL  C) Discourtesy: Dismissed, complaint about court ruling Dismissed, no jurisdiction Dismissed, inadequate factual basis Dismissal with warning Dismissal after full investigation Deferred discipline agreement	0 0 0 0 0 0
Recommendation of removal from office TOTAL  C) Discourtesy: Dismissed, complaint about court ruling Dismissed, no jurisdiction Dismissed, inadequate factual basis Dismissal with warning Dismissal after full investigation Deferred discipline agreement Private reprimand	0 0 0 0 0 0 0
Recommendation of removal from office TOTAL  C) Discourtesy: Dismissed, complaint about court ruling Dismissed, no jurisdiction Dismissed, inadequate factual basis Dismissal with warning Dismissal after full investigation Private reprimand Private censure	0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0
Recommendation of removal from office TOTAL  C) Discourtesy: Dismissed, complaint about court ruling Dismissed, no jurisdiction Dismissed, inadequate factual basis Dismissal with warning Dismissal after full investigation Private reprimand Private censure	0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0
Recommendation of removal from office TOTAL  C) Discourtesy: Dismissed, complaint about court ruling Dismissed, no jurisdiction Dismissed, inadequate factual basis Dismissal with warning Dismissal after full investigation Private reprimand Private censure Public reprimand	0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0
Recommendation of removal from office TOTAL  C) Discourtesy: Dismissed, complaint about court ruling Dismissed, no jurisdiction Dismissed, inadequate factual basis Dismissal with warning Dismissal after full investigation Private reprimand Private censure Public reprimand Public censure Other	0 1 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0
Recommendation of removal from office TOTAL  C) Discourtesy:  Dismissed, complaint about court ruling Dismissed, no jurisdiction Dismissed, inadequate factual basis Dismissal with warning Dismissal after full investigation Private reprimand Private censure Public reprimand Public censure	0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0
Recommendation of removal from office TOTAL  C) Discourtesy: Dismissed, complaint about court ruling Dismissed, no jurisdiction Dismissed, inadequate factual basis Dismissal with warning Dismissal after full investigation Private reprimand Private censure Public reprimand Public censure Other Retired complaint, no longer a judge Suspension	0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0
Recommendation of removal from office TOTAL  C) Discourtesy:  Dismissed, complaint about court ruling Dismissed, no jurisdiction Dismissed, inadequate factual basis Dismissal with warning Dismissal after full investigation Private reprimand Private censure Public reprimand Public censure Retired complaint, no longer a judge Suspension Recommendation of removal from office	0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0
Recommendation of removal from office TOTAL  C) Discourtesy:  Dismissed, complaint about court ruling Dismissed, no jurisdiction Dismissed, inadequate factual basis Dismissal with warning Dismissal after full investigation Private reprimand Private censure Public reprimand Public censure Other Retired complaint, no longer a judge Suspension Recommendation of removal from office TOTAL	0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0
Recommendation of removal from office TOTAL  C) Discourtesy: Dismissed, complaint about court ruling Dismissed, no jurisdiction Dismissed, inadequate factual basis Dismissal with warning Dismissal after full investigation Private reprimand Private censure Public reprimand Public censure Cother Retired complaint, no longer a judge Suspension Recommendation of removal from office TOTAL  D) Abuse of office:	0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0
Recommendation of removal from office TOTAL  C) Discourtesy:  Dismissed, complaint about court ruling Dismissed, no jurisdiction Dismissed, inadequate factual basis Dismissal with warning Dismissal after full investigation Private reprimand Private censure Public reprimand Retired complaint, no longer a judge Recommendation of removal from office TOTAL  D) Abuse of office: Dismissed, complaint about court ruling	0 1 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0
Recommendation of removal from office TOTAL  C) Discourtesy:  Dismissed, complaint about court ruling Dismissed, no jurisdiction Dismissed, inadequate factual basis Dismissal with warning Dismissal after full investigation Private reprimand Private censure Public reprimand Retired complaint, no longer a judge Recommendation of removal from office TOTAL  D) Abuse of office: Dismissed, complaint about court ruling Dismissed, no jurisdiction	0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0
Recommendation of removal from office TOTAL  C) Discourtesy:  Dismissed, complaint about court ruling Dismissed, no jurisdiction Dismissed, inadequate factual basis Dismissal with warning Dismissal after full investigation Private reprimand Private censure Public reprimand Retired complaint, no longer a judge Recommendation of removal from office TOTAL  D) Abuse of office: Dismissed, complaint about court ruling	0 1 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0

Dismissal after full investigation	0
Deferred discipline agreement	0
Private reprimand	0
Private censure	0
Public reprimand	0
Public censure	0
Other	
Retired complaint, no longer a judge	
Suspension	0
Recommendation of removal from office	0
TOTAL	3
E) Delay:	_
Dismissed, complaint about court ruling	0
Dismissed, no jurisdiction	0
Dismissed, inadequate factual basis	
Dismissal with warning	
Dismissal after full investigation	
Deferred discipline agreement	
Private reprimand Private censure	0
Public reprimand	0
Public censure	0
Other	_
Retired complaint, no longer a judge	
Suspension	0
Recommendation of removal from office	_
TOTAL	0
F) Ex parte communications:	J
Dismissed, complaint about court ruling	0
Dismissed, no jurisdiction	
Dismissed, inadequate factual basis	
Dismissal with warning	0
Dismissal after full investigation	
Deferred discipline agreement	0
Private reprimand	0
Private censure	0
Public reprimand	0
Public censure	0
Other	0
Retired complaint, no longer a judge	0
Suspension	0
Recommendation of removal from office	0
TOTAL	1
G) Disability:	
Dismissed, complaint about court ruling	0
Dismissed, no jurisdiction	
Dismissed, inadequate factual basis	1