

ADM2016-00040

JUN 2 0 2016

Clerk of the Courts Rec'd By

James M. Hivner, Clerk

615-253-1470

100 Supreme Court Building

401 Seventh Avenue, North Nashville, TN 37219-1407

## THE TENNESSEE BOARD OF JUDICIAL CONDUCT

June 17, 2016

511 Union Street Suite 600 Nashville, TN 37219

MEMBERS OF THE TENNESSEE BOARD OF JUDICIAL CONDUCT

Chris Craft Chairperson

Timothy R. Discenza Disciplinary Counsel

Patrick J. McHale Assistant Disciplinary Counsel

Kenny Armstrong Miles Burdine Angelita B. Dalton Joe F. Fowlkes Tas Gardner Dee Gay J. Ronald Hickman Chris A. Hodges Thomas W. Lawless Christy R. Little Larry J. Logan Norma Ogle Ward Phillips J. Michael Sharp

Dwight E. Stokes

Russell Humphrey Chief Clerk of the Senate Office of the Chief Clerk State Capitol, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor Nashville, TN 37243

Joe McCord Chief Clerk of the House Office of the Chief Clerk State Capitol, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor Nashville, TN 37243

Dear Chief Clerks:

Please find enclosed the statistical report of the Board of Judicial Conduct covering filings and dispositions for the month of May, 2016, as mandated by Tenn. Code Ann. § 17-5-207.

Sincerely,

CHRIS CRAFT Board Chair

CC/bep

## BOARD OF JUDICIAL CONDUCT MONTHLY REPORT FOR MAY 2016

The number and category of complaints OPENED<sup>1</sup>:

|                                    | <b>THIS</b> | THIS FISCAL |
|------------------------------------|-------------|-------------|
|                                    | MONTH       | <u>YEAR</u> |
| A) Failure to comply with law:     | 19          | 274         |
| B) Bias, prejudice and unfairness: | . 3         | 29          |
| C) Discourtesy:                    | - 1         | 10          |
| D) Abuse of office:                | 2           | 5           |
| E) Delay:                          | 5           | 31          |
| F) Ex parte communications:        | - 1         | 5           |
| G) Disability:                     | 0           | 0           |
| H) Political violation:            | - 0         | 1           |
| I) Recusal:                        | - 4         | 27          |
| J) Miscellaneous:                  | - <u>0</u>  | <u>1</u>    |
| TOTAL                              | 35          | 383         |
|                                    |             |             |

FILED
JUN 20 2016
Clerk of the Courts
Rec'd By

The number and category of complaints CLOSED:

|                                    | <b>THIS</b>  | THIS FISCAL |
|------------------------------------|--------------|-------------|
|                                    | <b>MONTH</b> | <u>YEAR</u> |
| A) Failure to comply with law:     | 22           | 256         |
| B) Bias, prejudice and unfairness: | 2            | 40          |
| C) Discourtesy:                    | 0            | 9           |
| D) Abuse of office:                | 0            | 3           |
| E) Delay:                          | 3            | 20          |
| F) Ex parte communications:        | 0            | 4           |
| G) Disability:                     | 0            | 1           |
| H) Political violation:            | 0            | 1           |
| I) Recusal:                        | 2            | 25          |
| J) Miscellaneous:                  | <u> </u>     | _1          |
| TOTAL                              | 29           | 360         |

<sup>1.</sup> A single complaint naming several judges is counted as a separate complaint against each judge. A complaint whose allegations encompass more than one category is listed under the most serious category alleged.

## DISPOSITION of the complaints closed by CATEGORY:

| <u>THIS</u>                                | THIS FISCAL |
|--|-------------|
| MONTH                                      | <u>YEAR</u> |
| A) Failure to comply with law:             |             |
| Dismissed, complaint about court ruling 21 | 237         |
| Dismissed, no jurisdiction 1               | 8           |
| Dismissed, inadequate factual basis 0      | 3           |
| Dismissal with warning 0                   | 1           |
| Dismissal after full investigation 0       | 0           |
| Deferred discipline agreement 0            | 1           |
| Private reprimand 0                        | 0           |
| Private censure 0                          | 0           |
| Public reprimand 0                         | 2           |
| Public censure 0                           | 0           |
| Other 0                                    | 2           |
| Retired complaint, no longer a judge 0     | 2           |
| Suspension 0                               | 0           |
| Recommendation of removal from office 0    | _0          |
| TOTAL 22                                   | 256         |

| M                                       | <u>THIS</u><br>IONTH | THIS FISCAL<br>YEAR |
|---|----------------------|---------------------|
| B) Bias, prejudice and unfairness:      |                      |                     |
| Dismissed, complaint about court ruling | 1                    | 2                   |
| Dismissed, no jurisdiction              | - 0                  | 0                   |
| Dismissed, inadequate factual basis     | 0                    | 35                  |
| Dismissal with warning                  | - 0                  | 0                   |
| Dismissal after full investigation      | - 0                  | 0                   |
| Deferred discipline agreement           | - 0                  | 0                   |
| Private reprimand                       |                      | 0                   |
| Private censure                         |                      | 0                   |
| Public reprimand                        |                      | 3                   |
| Public censure                          | 0                    | 0                   |
| Other                                   | 0                    | 0                   |
| Retired complaint, no longer a judge    | 0                    | 0                   |
| Suspension                              | · <b>-</b> 0         | 0                   |
| Recommendation of removal from office - | 0                    | _0                  |
| TOTAL                                   | 2                    | 40                  |

| <u>T</u>                                | <u>HIS</u> | THIS FISCAL |
|---|------------|-------------|
| <u>MC</u>                               | <u>NTH</u> | <u>YEAR</u> |
| C) Discourtesy:                         |            |             |
| Dismissed, complaint about court ruling | 0          | 1           |
| Dismissed, no jurisdiction              | 0          | 0           |
| Dismissed, inadequate factual basis     | 0          | 4           |
| Dismissal with warning                  | 0          | 1           |
| Dismissal after full investigation      | 0          | 0           |
| Deferred discipline agreement           | 0          | 0           |
| Private reprimand                       | 0          | 3           |
| Private censure                         | 0          | 0           |
| Public reprimand                        | 0          | 0           |
| Public censure                          | 0          | 0           |
| Other                                   | 0          | 0           |
| Retired complaint, no longer a judge    | 0          | 0           |
| Suspension                              | 0          | 0           |
| Recommendation of removal from office   | 0          | _0          |
| TOTAL                                   | 0          | 9           |

| <u>THIS</u><br><u>MONTH</u>               | THIS FISCAL<br>YEAR |
|---|---------------------|
| D) Abuse of office:                       |                     |
| Dismissed, complaint about court ruling 0 | 0                   |
| Dismissed, no jurisdiction 0              | 0                   |
| Dismissed, inadequate factual basis 0     | 1                   |
| Dismissal with warning 0                  | 0                   |
| Dismissal after full investigation 0      | 0                   |
| Deferred discipline agreement 0           | 0                   |
| Private reprimand 0                       | 1                   |
| Private censure 0                         | 0                   |
| Public reprimand 0                        | 0                   |
| Public censure 0                          | 0                   |
| Other 0                                   | 1                   |
| Retired complaint, no longer a judge 0    | 0                   |
| Suspension 0                              | 0                   |
| Recommendation of removal from office 0   | 0                   |
| TOTAL $\overline{0}$                      | 3                   |

|  | <u>THIS</u>                           | THIS FISCAL                                 |
|--|---------------------------------------|---|
|  | <b>MONTH</b>                          | <u>YEAR</u>                                 |
| E) Delay:  |                                       |   |
| Dismissed, complaint about court ruling  | g 0                                   | 0   |
| Dismissed, no jurisdiction   | 0                                     | 0   |
| Dismissed, inadequate factual basis  | 3                                     | 20  |
| Dismissal with warning   | 0                                     | 0   |
| Dismissal after full investigation   | 0                                     | 0   |
| Deferred discipline agreement  | 0                                     | 0   |
| Private reprimand  | 0                                     | 0   |
| Private censure  | 0                                     | 0   |
| Public reprimand   | 0                                     | 0   |
| Public censure   | 0                                     | 0   |
| Other  | 0                                     | 0   |
| Retired complaint, no longer a judge   | 0                                     | 0   |
| Suspension   |                                       | 0   |
| Recommendation of removal from offi-   |                                       | _0  |
| TOTAL  |                                       | $\overline{20}$                             |
|  |                                       |   |
|  |                                       |   |
|  |                                       |   |
|  | THIS                                  | THIS FISCAL                                 |
|  | <u>THIS</u><br>MONTH                  | THIS FISCAL<br>YEAR                         |
| F) Ex parte communications:  |                                       |   |
| F) Ex parte communications: Dismissed, complaint about court rulin   | MONTH                                 |   |
| · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·  | <u>MONTH</u>                          | YEAR  |
| Dismissed, complaint about court rulin   | MONTH  ag 0 0                         | YEAR<br>0                                   |
| Dismissed, complaint about court rulin Dismissed, no jurisdiction  | MONTH  ag 0  0                        | <u>YEAR</u> 0 1                             |
| Dismissed, complaint about court rulin Dismissed, no jurisdiction  | MONTH  ag 0 0 0                       | 9<br>0<br>1<br>3                            |
| Dismissed, complaint about court rulin Dismissed, no jurisdiction Dismissed, inadequate factual basis Dismissal with warning | MONTH  ag 0 0 0 0                     | YEAR  0 1 3 0                               |
| Dismissed, complaint about court rulin Dismissed, no jurisdiction  | MONTH  ag 0 0 0 0                     | YEAR  0 1 3 0 0                             |
| Dismissed, complaint about court rulin Dismissed, no jurisdiction  | MONTH  ag 0 0 0 0 0 0                 | YEAR  0 1 3 0 0 0 0 0                       |
| Dismissed, complaint about court rulin Dismissed, no jurisdiction  | MONTH  ag 0 0 0 0 0 0                 | YEAR  0 1 3 0 0 0 0 0 0                     |
| Dismissed, complaint about court rulin Dismissed, no jurisdiction  | MONTH  ag 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0             | YEAR  0 1 3 0 0 0 0 0 0 0                   |
| Dismissed, complaint about court rulin Dismissed, no jurisdiction  | MONTH  ag 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0             | YEAR  0 1 3 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0               |
| Dismissed, complaint about court rulin Dismissed, no jurisdiction  | MONTH  ag 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 1           | YEAR  0 1 3 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0             |
| Dismissed, complaint about court rulin Dismissed, no jurisdiction  | MONTH  ag 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0       | YEAR  0 1 3 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0         |
| Dismissed, complaint about court rulin Dismissed, no jurisdiction  | MONTH  ag 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0       | YEAR  0 1 3 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0   |
| Dismissed, complaint about court rulin Dismissed, no jurisdiction  | MONTH  ag 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 | YEAR  0 1 3 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 |

| <u>T</u>                                | <u>HIS</u> | THIS FISCAL |
|---|------------|-------------|
| <u>MC</u>                               | NTH        | <u>YEAR</u> |
| G) Disability:                          |            |             |
| Dismissed, complaint about court ruling | 0          | 0           |
| Dismissed, no jurisdiction              | 0          | 0           |
| Dismissed, inadequate factual basis     | 0          | 0           |
| Dismissal with warning                  | 0          | 0           |
| Dismissal after full investigation      | 0          | 0           |
| Deferred discipline agreement           |            | 1           |
| Private reprimand                       | 0          | 0           |
| Private censure                         | 0          | 0           |
| Public reprimand                        | 0          | 0           |
| Public censure                          | 0          | 0           |
| Other                                   | 0          | 0           |
| Retired complaint, no longer a judge    |            | 0           |
| Suspension                              | 0          | 0           |
| Recommendation of removal from office   | 0          | _0          |
| TOTAL                                   | 0          | 1           |

| Tì                                      | 2ILI  | THIS FISCAL |
|---|-------|-------------|
| MO                                      | NTH   | YEAR        |
| H) Political violation:                 | 11111 | TEH         |
|   | ^     | 0           |
| Dismissed, complaint about court ruling | U     | U           |
| Dismissed, no jurisdiction              | 0     | 0           |
| Dismissed, inadequate factual basis     | 0     | 0           |
| Dismissal with warning                  | 0     | 1           |
| Dismissal after full investigation      | 0     | 0           |
| Deferred discipline agreement           | 0     | 0           |
| Private reprimand                       | 0     | 0           |
| Private censure                         | 0     | 0           |
| Public reprimand                        | 0     | 0           |
| Public censure                          | 0     | 0           |
| Other                                   | 0     | 0           |
| Retired complaint, no longer a judge    | 0     | 0           |
| Suspension                              | 0     | 0           |
| Recommendation of removal from office   | 0     | _0          |
| TOTAL                                   | 0     | 1           |

| <u>T</u>                                | <u>HIS</u> | THIS FISCAL |
|---|------------|-------------|
| <u>MC</u>                               | NTH        | <u>YEAR</u> |
| I) Recusal:                             |            |             |
| Dismissed, complaint about court ruling | 0          | 0           |
| Dismissed, no jurisdiction              | 0          | 0           |
| Dismissed, inadequate factual basis     | 1          | 20          |
| Dismissal with warning                  | 0          | 0           |
| Dismissal after full investigation      | 0          | 0           |
| Deferred discipline agreement           |            | 0           |
| Private reprimand                       | 0          | 2           |
| Private censure                         |            | 0           |
| Public reprimand                        | 1          | 2           |
| Public censure                          | 0          | 0           |
| Other                                   | 0          | 1           |
| Retired complaint, no longer a judge    | 0          | 0           |
| Suspension                              | 0          | 0           |
| Recommendation of removal from office   | 0          | _0          |
| TOTAL                                   | 2          | 25          |

|   | <b>THIS</b> | THIS FISCAL |
|---|-------------|-------------|
| <u>N</u>                                | 10NTH       | <u>YEAR</u> |
| J) Miscellaneous:                       |             |             |
| Dismissed, complaint about court ruling | 0           | 0           |
| Dismissed, no jurisdiction              | 0           | 0           |
| Dismissed, inadequate factual basis     | 0           | 1           |
| Dismissal with warning                  | <b></b> 0   | 0           |
| Dismissal after full investigation      | 0           | 0           |
| Deferred discipline agreement           | 0           | 0           |
| Private reprimand                       | 0           | 0           |
| Private censure                         | 0           | 0           |
| Public reprimand                        | 0           | 0           |
| Public censure                          | 0           | 0           |
| Other                                   | 0           | 0           |
| Retired complaint, no longer a judge    | 0           | 0           |
| Suspension                              | 0           | 0           |
| Recommendation of removal from office   | <u>0</u>    | _0          |
| TOTAL                                   | 0           | 1           |